

date: June 2006



Appendix Two To TUC/SGA Strategic Grant Agreement Final Report

A short impact study

By Peter Kirby, Freelance Trade Union Education Consultant

Contents

5 Introduction

Aims of the study

Methodology

Report structure

7 Impact of the SGA Project set against project outcomes, indicators and means of verification

2.1 Outcome: "The TUC is more aware of the International development agenda, through engagement with key regional, national and international players from across the development sector"

Impact Example No.1

2.2 Outcome: "The TUC's constituent members will have greater awareness of international development issues"

Impact Example No.2

TUC Education and international development

Impact Example No.3

Amicus: Embedding international development into the union education programme

Impact Example No.4

Prospect Millennium Development Goals Seminar

Impact Example No.5

World's Apart - People Together: Northern TUC Young Members

2.3 Outcome: "The TUC has the organisational and institutional capacity to plan and deliver effective activities around its experience and comparative advantage, including connections with and ability to influence international TU organisations and governments"

Impact Example No. 6

TUC Northern Region & Sierra Leone Labour Congress

19 Conculsion

Section one

Introduction

Aims of the study

The TUC commissioned this short impact study with the following aims:

- to analyse the evidence relating to the work of the SGA Project with particular reference to the outcomes in the SGA monitoring framework
- to assess the impact of the SGA Project based upon the evidence collected and some limited follow up with trade union contacts

This study is not an end of project evaluation, but is designed to look selectively at the impact of the SGA Project and some examples of impact are provided. The examples come from contact with the TUC and a limited number of trades unions. There will undoubtedly be many other examples of impact upon the TUC and affiliated trades unions and their members.

This study will complement the main SGA Project Completion report which contains much evidence of impact. There has been a conscious effort in this study not to repeat evidence of impact contained in the main SGA Project Completion report.

Methodology

The TUC requested a “desk impact study” which was scheduled to take between five and eight working days. The work undertaken during the study included:

- an initial meeting with the SGA Project Officer and with the TUC Advisor on International Development
- reading and investigating evidence collected by the SGA Project Officer
- raising queries about existing evidence or additional evidence required
- analysing the evidence collected with a particular emphasis upon the impact that the Project has had upon the trade union movement
- identifying key aspects of the project and following up the impact by means of brief questionnaire and/or telephone interview
- production of a short impact report for the TUC

Introduction

Report structure

The report has been structured in a way that systematically addresses the Monitoring Framework Outcomes from the Strategic Grant Agreement between the TUC and DfID. The report seeks to examine impact by way of:

- analysis of collected evidence set against measurable indicators and means of verification
- six examples tracing what happened as a result of the SGA project

By examining impact in relation to Monitoring Framework Outcomes, conclusions can be drawn about impact in relation to the overall Monitoring Framework Project Goal.

Section two

Impact of the SGA Project set against project outcomes, indicators and means of verification

2.1 Outcome: “The TUC is more aware of the International development agenda, through engagement with key regional, national and international players from across the development sector”

2.1. (a) Measurable indicator: The TUC engages in regular discussion and exchange of information on key issues ie. core labour rights

An analysis of the evidence shows considerable impact in relation to this aspect of the Project. There has been consistent TUC and affiliated trade union dialogue with DfID and responses to DfID consultation initiatives. This has led amongst other things to the formation of a DfID Labour Standards Forum and DfID procedures for working with trade unions in the UK and in the South. The DfID/TUC Forum which meets three times per year enables senior members of the TUC and affiliated unions to influence Government.

Owen Tudor is the Head of TUC European Union and International Relations Department (EUIRD). He says “We now focus much more on international development issues rather than just foreign policy matters. The project has led to far better links with DfID and development groups.”

There is evidence referred to elsewhere in this short study that shows considerable impact in relation to TUC discussion and exchange of information with trade union affiliates and development groups.

2.1. (b) Measurable indicator: The TUC engages with new groups/networks and strengthens existing links with development groups

An analysis of the evidence shows considerable impact in relation to this aspect of the Project. For example, the TUC role in Play Fair at the Olympics and Make Poverty History (MPH) (see Impact Example No.1 below) amply demonstrates significant engagement with both existing and new development

groups and networks. The TUC involvement along with five other networks in a post MPH Global Justice Network shows the TUC's new centrality within development campaigning.

Impact Example No.1

Make Poverty History

In the autumn of 2004, the TUC joined the MPH coordination team, alongside a range of development agencies and NGOs. The TUC was also instrumental in encouraging the full involvement of other members of the international trade union movement in the Global Call to Action against Poverty.

The TUC played a key role in the Make Poverty History campaign ensuring that the central role of workers' rights and decent work in any sustainable attempts to reduce poverty are recognised.

The TUC also played a key role in the way that it encouraged and facilitated the support of affiliated unions in the MPH campaign. Over 30 trade unions were involved, with the majority playing an active role. Some of these unions had never previously been involved with international development issues. The MPH Trade Union Working Group met regularly and brought together many of the trade unions involved in the campaign. Ninety eight per cent of trade unionists responding to a survey at TUC Congress in 2005 were aware of MPH. Ninety per cent had been informed by their unions about how to get involved.

Trade union branded materials were produced as an integral part of the campaign along with MPH being a prominent feature across a wide range of TUC and trade union national and regional events. For example, TUC Education workshops; trade union conferences; Black Workers and Youth Conferences; the Tolpuddle festival and so on. This culminated in a highly visible trade union presence at the Edinburgh rally.

2.1. (c) Measurable indicator: The TUC is proactive in widening the International Development Group to include new trade unions and other civil society organisations

An analysis of the evidence shows some impact in relation to this aspect of the Project. TUC evidence of attendance at IDG meetings shows that the number of trades unions attending one or more meetings has risen from 8 to 20. The number of NGOs has risen from 4 to 8. The opportunity for regular dialogue must contribute to the successful involvement of affiliates in campaigns such as MPH.

Owen Tudor comments "We now are able to engage with trades unions in an effective way and unions and their members are much more likely to come back to us on international development issues. For example, our links with trade unions previously used to focus a lot around policy. Now engagement is

much more about practical activity and international development. Consequently there is much greater overlap between the International Development Group and the TUC Union International Officers' meetings.”

2.1. (d) Measurable indicator: The TUC documents its experience of international development, analyses the information and indicates clear lessons learned

An analysis of the evidence shows considerable impact in relation to this aspect of the Project. The TUC has developed a three year international strategy as part of its annual internal operation plan. International development features prominently in the strategy. Owen Tudor believes that the SGA Project led his Department into 3 year planning so that they can plan ahead rather than merely respond. He says “International development is not ‘bolt-on’ territory. We continually think about international issues with a development focus. International development is now embedded into all the work of our Department and forms a key part of our strategy.” The operational plan is reviewed twice a year.

Consultation with and feedback from affiliates is maintained through the vehicles of the International Development Group and the Union International Officers meetings with EUIRD.

There is also considerable evidence of the SGA influencing the work of the different departments of the TUC. National seminars with union education/international officers, trade union tutors and NGOs have greatly contributed to education strategy. Liz Rees, Trade Union Education Manager for the TUC’s Unionlearn says “The SGA Project has helped us to revitalise the trade union agenda for international development.”

2.2 Outcome: “The TUC’s constituent members will have greater awareness of international development issues”

2.2. (a) Measurable indicator: Development of a website and indication of interest in it

There is considerable evidence of the impact of the SGA Project on the TUC website. A specific International Development Awareness web page has been created on the International web page. There is an average of 14,000 hits per month on this page. Visitors to the International Development Awareness page are able to access numerous resources, including: all the newly developed education materials, fact files and digests; ‘International Development Matters;’ regular SGA Project updates; and details of TUC international development campaigns and how to get involved. Download totals of International Fact Files show considerable usage being made of the resources.

2.2. (b) Measurable indicator: Newsletter 'International Development Matters' reflects increased members interest in development

During the course of the SGA Project, subscriptions to 'International Development Matters' increased by six hundred to over two and half thousand.

2.2. (c) Measurable indicator: Mainstream TUC publications feature international development articles

Accessible international development materials (see full details in 2.2 (d) below) have been one of the key aims of the SGA Project in its work with the Campaigns and Communications Department.

For the last three years, the TUC annual International Women's Day celebration has been strongly influenced by the SGA Project. This has meant that each celebration has had a heavy international development focus. Inevitably, publicity and publications for International Women's Day have strongly featured international development themes. TUC Congress Guides have also included international development themes in 2003 and 2005.

There has been a considerable impact upon TUC campaigning themes in 2004 with Play Fair at the Olympics, and in 2005 with Make Poverty History. Rob Sanders, Head of Campaigns and Communications, is clear that "The impetus for the campaigning work for Play Fair and MPH came from the SGA Project as they were taking the lead. At times MPH work involved all members of our Department."

2.2. (d) Measurable indicator: Union members have access to and use resources that promote understanding of development issues

There is considerable evidence of impact in relation to access to resources. Examples include:

- the development and use of a wealth of high quality, international development education materials in close co-operation with the TUC Education Section of the Organisation and Services Department, union education/international officers and experienced trade union tutors (see further details in Impact Example No.2 and No.3 below)
- TUC campaigning materials for MPH and Play Fair
- the Women and Globalisation Conference and report
- high profile organisation of events each year to celebrate International Women's Day with a strong international development focus
- international development seminars and workshops
- coverage of international development issues in union journals

- the increasing prominence of international development issues at the annual TUC Congress and Congress fringe
- the extensive resources on the TUC website, and
- the increasing involvement of affiliated trade unions and their members in international development education

The TUC Survey at TUC Congress 2005 shows that over 50% of respondents thought that the amount of information on international development had increased.

Impact in the use of resources can be demonstrated in many ways. For example, by trade union and member involvement in MPH; evidence collected from some trades unions showing the increasing number of motions at their conferences about international development; and trades unions' officers pointing to the increasing interest of members who want to take practical steps in relation to international development.

Impact Example No.2

TUC Education and international development

Close co-operation between the SGA Project Officer, TUC Campaigns and Communications, TUC Organisation and Services Department, Trade Union Education Officers and experienced trade union studies tutors resulted in the production of numerous international development training resources. The resources are available for download at www.tuc.org.uk/developmentresourcesandfunding.

In order to ensure that the international resources could be used by tutors and trade union representatives on training courses, during 2005 it was necessary to write new National Open College Network Units and amend existing Units. Participants on TUC and trade union courses can now obtain NOCN credits for a number of international development courses.

The new training resources have been highlighted at three national development education seminars, one 2-day national training workshop, and two regional TUC tutor briefings. In addition, all new TUC tutors who have to attend a five day TUC tutor briefing are introduced to the international development resources and gain experience of how to integrate the resources into the TUC core programme.

A questionnaire was sent to a small sample of trade union tutors who have attended one or more of the above. The response below gives an example of how action has taken place following attendance. Shan Maidment, Head of the School of Trade Union Education, City of Bristol College, replied after consulting tutors in the School who had attended. Their response to selected questions says "We arranged for other tutors to be briefed, the materials were

circulated for use and we discussed the context for use. Target 2015 is used on all core courses; International Health and Safety book extracts are used on all health and safety courses, and on women's courses. Development fact files are used on Stage 1 union rep courses as appropriate, and Professional Officers training on organising migrant workers. Play Fair at the Olympics was used in the lead up to the Olympics on any appropriate courses. We feel that International Development Digests and Fact Files are especially useful." In the opinion of the tutors, there has been a "very good" response by trade union participants to the use of the resources and this has promoted understanding of development issues.

TUC Education is promoting the use of international development resources through trade union course co-ordinator meetings in other Regions during 2006. Liz Rees, Trade Union Education Manager for the TUC, says that the SGA Project has had a considerable impact upon trade union tutors and union representatives. She gives the following examples:

- "a much broader range of high quality support and materials"
- "increasing demand for the SGA Project Officer to attend course"
- co-ordinator meetings. This helps in two ways: Gemma Freedman can explain what is on offer and the support available; and tutors can explain their needs and those of union representatives"
- "the range of programmes offered. For example, we now have a growing interest from two or three Regions for a TUC Access to Higher Education course in international development"

Impact Example No.3

Amicus: Embedding international development into the union education programme

Amicus had an existing "Africa Matters" Project. With the help of the SGA Project mini-learning fund, an "Africa Matters" educational module was developed.

However, there have also been other developments within Amicus. According to Harriet Eisner, the Amicus International Officer, and Andrew Murray, the Amicus Education Officer, it became clear that materials were also needed that introduced members and activists to: international development in a wider setting; practical solidarity; and the skills to get involved.

Using and adapting many of the Development Education materials on the TUC website, Amicus has now developed introductory materials. The materials have recently been piloted and are currently being rolled out nationally and in the regions through the Amicus education programme. For example, the first regional workshop will be held in the West Midlands on 12 May 2006. And

the international development introductory materials will be built into a new Workplace Reps Stage 4 course, which will be offered to Amicus members as part of the Amicus national education programme later this year.

Harriet comments that “The longer term benefit of our involvement with the SGA project has been about mainstreaming international development into our education programme. The TUC SGA Project has harnessed the enthusiasm and demand that is already out there to build relationships with sister organisations in developing countries. The TUC SGA Project has done a superb job in helping us to develop the awareness of our members.”

2.2. (e) Measurable indicator: Increased number of union members aware of international development and rights based approach

There is considerable evidence of impact in relation to international development awareness that has previously been referred to under Section 2. 2. (d) above. Impact Examples No.4 and No.5 below amply demonstrate how a small amount of money from SGA “Mini-Grants” goes a long way in terms of international development awareness.

Impact Example No.4

Prospect Millennium Development Goals Seminar

With SGA (mini grant) support, Prospect held a conference on 27 February 2006 at TUC Congress House. The Conference was very well attended by 60 delegates, including 45 Prospect members representing 27 different branches. The speaker list included Hilary Benn; Foster Kotey (CWU of Ghana TUC being supported by another SGA grant); and other speakers from the TUC, War on Want, ILO, NATFHE, National Resources Institute, MET Office, One World, and Prospect. The day event was broken into three parts – each session ending with a panel discussion.

Looking at the issues from a global perspective including the MDGs

- Case studies presented by Prospect members including Health and Safety Executive (HSE) members who talked about their use of the SGA funded International Health and Safety Workbook, where 15 members had been meeting once a month in a discussion group based around different sections of the workbook
- ‘Getting started’ on International Development, campaigning on issues and corporate social responsibility as part of the bargaining agenda

Beverly Hall is the Prospect International Development Officer. Beverly believes that the TUC SGA Project acted as a catalyst for her union creating this post. “The SGA Project raised the profile of international development within the TUC. It drew people in instead of it being all policy related, and it

came down to 'actuals' like "Make Poverty History", "Play Fair" and so on. There was a groundswell within Prospect leading to the appointment of an International Development Officer." Beverley feels that the results of the SGA sponsored seminar "will keep me very busy for a long while, as the impact upon the membership has been enormous." Practical action since the Conference has included:

- A motion to the Prospect Biennial Conference in May 2006, that specifically refers to the February MDG seminar and calls upon the Prospect National Executive Committee to raise members' awareness of key international development issues and highlight opportunities for involvement; provide support and guidance for Branches to pursue international development aims in the workplace; and develop and promote a model Corporate Social Responsibility policy, seek implementation by a wide range of Prospect employers, and publicise examples of good practice
- A full page report on the MDG seminar in the March 2006 Prospect monthly journal mailed directly to 120,000 members
- Approaches to Beverley by two groups of members from EDF Energy (see below) and the HSE proposing new initiatives
- A direct link between Foster Kotey and DfID in relation to structures that the Ghana TUC has in place to engage with Accra street vendors. This should be of great value to DfID in Ghana
- New levels of communication between Prospect scientists and DfID that are ongoing regarding funding for scientific work in developing countries
- An approach by HSE members to the Ethical Trading Initiative to offer assistance in relation to health and safety standards in workplaces

Beverley continues "As a result of the Conference, many Prospect members indicated that the new awareness of trade union activity could serve as a potential link into local trade unionists when conducting research and scientific work in developing countries. Previously they had not seen their own trade union membership as a way of engaging in international development. I have just come from a meeting with EDF Energy Branch who want to develop a project where Prospect facilitates engagement with trades unionists in developing countries when members are on holiday or working. They also want to link with Engineers without Frontiers, where they can assist with their engineering skills."

And Beverley sees the motion to Conference as providing the springboard for the Prospect International Development work plan. She concludes "In the longer term our goal is corporate social responsibility on bargaining agendas with employers. This is a concrete way that union members can engage with an employer."

Impact Example No.5

World's Apart - People Together: Northern TUC Young Members

Following the visits of TUC Northern Region delegates to Costa Rica, Colombia and Sierra Leone, an SGA mini grant helped TUC Northern Region Young Members Network to produce an attractive and well designed booklet “World’s Apart-People Together.” 15,000 copies of the booklet were printed. The booklet showed some of the challenges faced by trades unionists in those countries and highlighted some of the relatively simple actions that can be taken to build a collective response to those challenges.

Members of the TUC Northern Region Young Members Network gave presentations and distributed the booklet throughout the TUC Northern Region, at the TUC International Forum, at conferences, workshops and in secondary schools. Suzanne Robinson, a union officer with Amicus at the time (now an officer with GMB), co-ordinated the project. Suzanne explains “Copies were distributed to representatives from a number of trade unions, advertised for members within the workplace to view in both staff canteens and staff rooms (on notice boards & in magazine racks). We trained 13 young activists in Speakers in School – who took copies to disburse around schools.

International visitors to the region received copies to take back to their members. I have also given copies to young GMB activists outside of the region to show an example of what the Young Members Network can do.”

The feedback that Suzanne received about the booklet ranged from very good to excellent, and promoted understanding of development issues. Suzanne says that as a result of the use of the booklet “People have become involved and registered with the organisations promoted – for example a number of reps contacted me about how they could support our international colleagues working on banana plantations. The booklet did highlight the importance of being involved, and the grants available to ensure awareness was made. The most important part of our trip to Costa Rica was that we would come back to Britain and ensure as many people as possible would know about the situation of these workers, and do all they can to help change.”

2.3 Outcome: “The TUC has the organisational and institutional capacity to plan and deliver effective activities around its experience and comparative advantage, including connections with and ability to influence international TU organisations and governments”

2.3. (a) Measurable indicator: Full time resource person appointed to EUIRD

The extensive impact of the work of Gemma Freedman, the SGA Project Officer is amply demonstrated by:

- reference to the SGA Project Completion Report
- this brief impact report and
- the wealth of evidence of international development activity that has taken place within the TUC and affiliated unions since the post was created

It is not appropriate to catalogue all this work in this short report. But feedback from TUC affiliates, NGOs, trades unionists from other countries, and tutors all show their high regard for the TUC SGA Project Officer and the SGA Project.

2.3. (b) Measurable indicator: Internal structures are in place to deliver SGA outputs

With an SGA Officer in post, there is ample evidence of structures being in place to deliver SGA outputs. The SGA Project has been carefully embedded both within EUIRD and cross departmentally. The Project has led in the opinion of Owen Tudor, Head of EUIRD to a “considerable impact across the whole of the TUC’s work.” Liz Rees, the TUC’s Trade Union Education Manager says “The Project has been of huge benefit to the organisation, with involvement right across the TUC.”

2.3. (c) Measurable indicator: International development organisations are consulted for advice on appropriate capacity building

The impact in this area has already been demonstrated in Section 2.1. (b) and Impact Example No.1 (above) along with detailed coverage in the SGA Project Completion Report.

2.3. (d) Measurable indicator: Effective dialogue and exchange of ideas with southern trades unions

There is considerable evidence of impact with numerous trade union visitors from developing countries being funded by the SGA Project. In addition, the integration of SGA objectives in EUIRD ensures a coherent approach to EUIRD input in international fora, such as ICFTU, ILO and so on. Impact Example No. 6 below again shows how a small amount of money from SGA “Mini-Grants” goes a long way in terms of effective dialogue and exchange of ideas.

Impact Example No. 6

TUC Northern Region & Sierra Leone Labour Congress

TUC Northern Region set up an international forum in 2003. The aims were to build understanding at the regional level of what was happening to trade unions in other parts of the world; to disseminate that knowledge throughout the region; and to build union-to-union solidarity.

TUC Northern Region has undertaken many activities to meet its international aims. Amongst these are the establishment of a strong relationship with the Sierra Leone Labour Congress (SLLC). In 2003, Gladys Branche, secretary of the Women's Wing visited the UK and addressed the TUC Northern Region International Forum, including meeting with Brendan Barber. This visit led to the Northern TUC (with CTUC support) sponsoring the inaugural Gender Conference for SLLC Women's Wing.

SGA Project support enabled the TUC Northern Region to build upon this work in 2005. Smollet J. Thollie from the Sierra Leone Teachers Union visited in February 2005. He built links with a number of trade union organisations including the main teachers' unions and met with DfID officials. According to Kevin Rowan, Regional Secretary of TUC Northern Region, Smollet's visit "also provided the motivation for staging an international seminar in the Region. One hundred people from a wide range of trades unions and other organisations attended the seminar which was also addressed by Hilary Benn, Secretary of State for DfID." In Kevin's opinion, one of the results of the visit is that the main teachers' unions have got a strong sense of commitment to Sierra Leone and practical twinning arrangements between schools have been another consequence.

Later, in December 2005, SGA Project support meant that Gladys Branche, secretary of the Women's Wing visited the UK again. Gladys was able to meet a number of organisations and participate in the TUC Northern Region international conference with 60 attendees from a wide range of trades unions and other organisations. In addition, Gladys was able to update everybody on the progress within SLLC since 2003, and with TUC support, develop a project bid to UNISON for training and organising within SLLC. UNISON has currently agreed to support this initiative in principle, to the extent of £25,000.

Kevin Rowan, Regional Secretary of TUC Northern Region concludes that: "having visitors to the Region has been really effective in finding out what is happening to trades unions in other parts of the world."

Finally, feedback from Adwoa Sakyi, Gender Officer of the General Agricultural Workers Union of Ghana TUC is worth mentioning in relation to this indicator. Adwoa was invited by the British TUC to participate in Make Poverty History events in Britain in December 2005. Apart from the impact that Adwoa's visit had upon British trades unionists and others, Adwoa reflects upon the impact of the visit upon her work. Adwoa says "I have embarked on awareness creation activities in the Agricultural Establishment and at

community levels to inform members on the impact of WTO rules on agriculture. It has enhanced my capacity building for addressing gender issues and promoting the rights of agricultural workers in the area of trade. Whilst I was in the UK, I built links with the TGWU, GMB, Fair Trade Foundation, Womankind, Gender experts of DTI. DFID Ghana has sent some materials to my office. There are positive indications that there is going to be collaboration in the areas of agriculture, forestry and gender.”

2.3. (e) Measurable indicator: Appropriate advocacy/lobbying strategies are identified to address problems in the south

2.3. (f) Measurable indicator: Lobbying/influencing strategies include the informal sector and wider poverty issues

There is considerable evidence of impact in relation to advocacy and lobbying strategies that has previously been referred to under Section 2. 1. (a) and 2 (1) (b) above, and in the SGA Project Completion Report.

Owen Tudor believes that the SGA Project has led to “enhanced integration with the work of DfID and we are now engaged in the detail of policy. Links with country DfID teams has taken off particularly in the third year of the Project. There is increasing contact between trades unions in the south and DfID country officers. And we now have enhanced contacts with those unions too.”

Section three

Conculsion

This short study has looked selectively at the impact of the SGA Project upon the TUC, its affiliates and their members. It has investigated and analysed evidence, referred to the SGA Project Completion Report and followed up of a sample of TUC officials, union officers and trade union tutors. All of this reveals a highly successful project, which has achieved considerable impact in a relatively short period of time.

There is ample evidence that the Project has achieved its Goal and can demonstrate:

- greater understanding of international issues across the UK trade union movement
- commitment to continued engagement with DFID and other key development players.



Trades Union Congress
Congress House
Great Russell Street
London WC1B 3LS

www.tuc.org.uk

contact:
Gemma Freedman
020 7467 1233
GFreedman@tuc.org.uk

© 2005 Trades Union Congress

For more copies of this title contact our ordering point on 020 7467 1294 or smills@tuc.org.uk. Bulk discounts may be offered.

All TUC publications may be made available for dyslexic or visually impaired readers, on request, in an agreed electronic format or in accessible formats such as braille, audio tape and large print, at no extra cost.